

To: Council in Committee of the Whole

From: Jag Sharma, City Manager,
Office of the City Manager

Report Number: CM-17-01

Date of Report: January 26, 2017

Date of Meeting: January 30, 2017

Subject: Health and Safety Audit Report

File: C-3100

1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this report is to present the KPMG Health and Safety Audit Report (Attachment 1).

2.0 Recommendation

It is recommended to City Council:

That Report CM-17-01 dated January 26, 2017 and Attachment 1, being the KPMG audit report for health and safety, be received for information and that the recommendations and management responses in the KPMG audit report be endorsed as the general basis for improving corporate health and safety.

3.0 Executive Summary

Not applicable.

4.0 Input From Other Sources

The health and safety audit by KPMG was conducted with the involvement of the appropriate City employees.

5.0 Analysis

On December 14, 2015, Council received, for information, the 2016 Audit Plan. The Plan was comprised of five audits, as follows:

- Real Estate Function
- Asset Management
- Oshawa Senior Citizens Centre (O.S.C.C.) Governance

- Health and Safety
- Fleet Purchasing and Inventory Management.

The Real Estate Function audit is complete. The Asset Management, O.S.C.C. Governance and Fleet audits are expected to be reported on in the first quarter 2017.

The Health and Safety audit contains eight recommendations related to the following aspects:

- Availability of health and safety-related information (high risk)
- Organization support for health and safety (medium risk)
- Escalation process for non-completion of training (medium risk)
- Joint Health and Safety Committee requirements (low risk)
- Incident report review by operation safety and training staff (low risk)
- Annual review of policies and procedures (low risk)
- Volunteers (low risk)

The KPMG recommendations and management response will be the basis for implementing improvements to corporate health and safety.

6.0 Financial Implications

There are no financial implications.

7.0 Relationship to the Oshawa Strategic Plan

This report responds to the goal of Accountable Leadership – Ensure respect, responsiveness and transparency with a specific connection to the theme of Our Corporate Culture Demands Excellence and Respect and the strategy “understand and support our most important resource – our employees”.



Helen Break, Director,
Strategic Initiatives



Jacqueline Long, Executive Director,
Human Resource Services



Jag Sharma, City Manager,
Office of the City Manager



City of Oshawa

Internal Audit of Health and Safety

November 2016

Overall report rating:

Yellow-red: Partial assurance with improvement opportunities

KPMG LLP

January 7, 2017

This report contains 22 pages

Appendices comprise 7 pages



Contents

	Page
1. Executive Summary	2
2. Recommendations	6
Appendices	
A. Summary of work and assurances	
B. Summary of testing results	
C. Staff involvement and documents reviewed	

Distribution

To (for action):

- Glenn Thurston – Manager, HR Services and Safety
- Scott Wood, Chief Training Officer of Fire

Cc (for information):

- Jackie Long – Executive Director of HR Services
- Ron Diskey – Commissioner, Community Services

Sponsor

- Jackie Long – Executive Director of HR Services

This report, together with its attachments, is provided pursuant to the terms of our engagement. The use of the report is solely for internal purposes by the management of the City of Oshawa, pursuant to the terms of the engagement, it should not be copied or disclosed to any third party or otherwise quoted or referred to, in whole in part, without our written consent.



Section One

Executive Summary

Conclusion

We have provided a grading of yellow-red (partial assurance with improvement opportunities) for the health and safety (H&S) audit. While efforts are made to provide training to staff on H&S matters and incident reports are collected, there is limited oversight of whether training is completed and specific H&S requirements across different departments. Current systems and processes are not out of line with other clients in the municipal sector. In addition, we were not able to be provided with a complete list of all incidents or current H&S training completion levels across the Corporation. Most records are still maintained on paper for incidents, and no overall training IT system exists to record attendance. Processes and oversight are generally better developed in Fire Services given a greater level of resources available and the nature of the operations. The Corporation should consider pooling of these resources with corporate resources to allow for improved H&S oversight and support for the entire organization.

Our review of the overall governance structure in relation to H&S illustrated there is a lack of oversight across the entire organization (note not all department were audited but only the ones that are inherently prone to high risk). Reporting is not routinely produced or easily available on H&S training completion or incidents to provide the Council, Corporate Leadership Team (CLT) and other senior directors of the Corporation. It is at the Director-level of the organization where greater ownership is required for H&S in their specific functions. Council and CLT should be provided with regular updates to allow for effective oversight and escalation of any issues (such as areas where training is not being completed, or with high levels of incidents). Human Resources (HR) should focus their role on supporting the Corporation in terms of reporting on incidents and training to allow oversight as well as compliance with the Occupational Health and Safety Act (OHSA).

Our analysis of the current training processes revealed a number of gaps in relation to how individuals are identified for particular training needs, storage of training records and escalation processes for those who have not attended necessary training. A training system should be considered to centralize all training records (some currently stored locally across the Corporation) and allow for reporting on mandatory training completion. In addition individual posts within departments have not had mandatory H&S training requirements identified as it is down to individual managers to identify the training needed by their staff. An exercise should be undertaken within departments to standardize, where possible, H&S training needs across the organization within different roles. In addition an escalation process needs to be established for addressing employees who have not attended



mandatory training. Responsibility needs to be at the Director-level, with reporting provided to CLT and Council periodically to allow for effective oversight. HR should follow up to ensure compliance.

When H&S incidents occur a report is required to be prepared. Attempts were made to have these recorded into PeopleSoft but the system proved to be unusable and reporting was not adequate. In 2014 a decision was made to switch back to the paper based system. This does not allow for easy analysis or oversight of incidents across the Corporation and it was not possible to receive a complete list of incidents. Opportunities should be investigated to look at ways in which greater resource sharing can occur with Fire Services and collaboration to enhance H&S oversight across the Corporation.

Our review of the H&S policies and procedures highlighted all necessary policies and procedures are documented and shared on the City of Oshawa's intranet for staff accessibility. This could be enhanced by incorporating a consistent process for the review of all H&S policies. In addition, through our review of the incident reporting some incident reports did not have a completed "Actions by Departmental Safety/Training Staff" section.

Background

This internal audit formed part of the Internal Audit Plan for 2016 for the City of Oshawa ("City" or "Corporation"). This review focused on H&S of staff within the Corporation. H&S in the workplace is considered the responsibility of all parties, however employers have the greatest responsibilities. In large organizations, the OHSA requires the establishment of a Joint Health and Safety Committee (JHSC) to work with management to uphold H&S standards in the workplace. Additionally, each organization must establish a written Occupational Health and Safety Policy, and maintain a program to implement that policy. This program can contain many different elements including worker training, workplace inspections, safe work practices and procedures and much more. To any organization, ensuring the H&S of employees should be a top priority. It also helps to facilitate a safe and productive working environment.

Objectives

Objective	Description of work undertaken
Objective one Reviewed the governance and organizational	We reviewed the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The roles and responsibilities for H&S across the Corporation; • The co-ordination across the Corporation around H&S; • The role of the JHSCs; • The data and information available around H&S including areas such as incidents and accidents, and training completion. This included



Objective	Description of work undertaken
structure around H&S	<p>consideration of the systems currently in place and how data is collected across the Corporation; and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comparison to leading practices from comparable municipalities where available. <p>We reviewed the overall arrangements in place for oversight of H&S as well as co-ordination of H&S resources.</p>
<p>Objective two</p> <p>Reviewed training processes and controls</p>	<p>We reviewed the current processes in place for the provision of training in relation to H&S, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The processes the Corporation has to ensure all H&S training required by legislation is provided to staff; • Current mandatory training completion rates for H&S; • Processes for ensuring staff attend training when required; and • Follow up of staff for non-attendance.

Areas of good practice

- ✓ **Established procedures to handle incidents** – The City of Oshawa has an established methodology to handle various types of incidents that can occur along with formalized procedures available on the intranet for reference.
- ✓ **Use of Standardized Forms** – Supervisor and Employee Incident/Accident Investigation Report form is used consistently across the City to report incidents.
- ✓ **Fire Services department** – A robust H&S system has been established to ensure adequate training is provided to staff and training records are retained.

Areas for development

- **H&S related information:** we noted improvements that could be made to the oversight of H&S incidents and H&S training with the introduction of regular reporting. In the longer term this will be supported through improved IT systems to help capture this information (**Recommendation 1**).
- **Current organizational support for H&S:** at present there are resources and processes that operate within Human Resources and Fire Services. We recommend consideration of combining these to provide a more effective H&S function for the Corporation as well as single systems and processes for monitoring incidents and training (as noted above). (**Recommendation 2**)



- **Training requirements of staff:** it is currently the responsibility of individual managers to identify the training requirements of staff in their area. In order to ensure consistency of the process an exercise should be undertaken by departments and branches to identify minimum H&S expectations of all roles in their area, with additional training added as required. HR should review this to ensure completeness and consistency where appropriate. **(Recommendation 3)**
- **Escalation process for non-completion of training:** currently there is no routine follow up or escalation of staff who have not completed training. A follow up process needs to be developed and articulated by HR, with responsibility for training completion at the Director level. **(Recommendation 4)**

Recommendations raised

We have raised the following recommendations (high priority represents the most urgent and high risk category):

	High	Medium	Low	Total
Raised	1	3	4	8
Accepted	1	3	4	8

Acknowledgement

We thank the staff involved for their help in completing this review.

Contact Information

The contacts at KPMG in connection with this report are:

Tony Malfara, Partner
 Tel: (416) 777-3461
 Cell: (416) 918-5483
tmalfara@kpmg.ca

Nick Rolfe, Senior Manager
 Tel: (416) 777-3543
 Cell: (647) 242-2452
nicholasrolfe@kpmg.ca

Sharmily Nadarajah,
 Consultant
 Tel: (647) 777-5166
snadarajah@kpmg.ca



Section Two

Recommendations

This section summarizes the recommendations that we have identified from our work. We have given each of our observations a risk rating as follows:

Priority rating for recommendations raised		
<p>High – (Priority One): Issues arising referring to important matters that are fundamental and material to the system of internal control. The matters observed might cause a system objective not to be met or leave a risk unmitigated and need to be addressed as a matter of urgency.</p>	<p>Medium – (Priority Two): Issues arising referring mainly to issues that have an important effect on the controls but do not require immediate action. A system objective may still be met in full or in part or a risk adequately mitigated, the weakness represents a deficiency in the system.</p>	<p>Low – (Priority Three): Issues arising that would, if corrected, improve internal control in general but are not vital to the overall system of internal control. These recommendations are of leading practice as opposed to weaknesses that prevent systems objectives being met.</p>

#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
1	High	<p>H&S related information</p> <p>We found that key information relating to H&S is not readily available for the Corporation as a whole. This included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> H&S Training: there is not one system / process in place across the Corporation to maintain a staff member’s training record. Paper records are maintained in some areas but could not easily be consolidated so we were not able to identify the current training completion in relation to H&S. 	



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> H&S incident reporting: this is currently a paper based system for Corporate HR. Previously attempts have been made to utilize PeopleSoft but the system could not be configured appropriately to address user needs. It was not possible to easily identify the number of incidents or types of incidents that have occurred without manually reviewing the paper records. <p>We recommend that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In the short term, reporting is developed by the Manager, H&S to compile incident and training statistics (e.g. number of incidents, types of incidents, training completion percentages) for the whole Corporation. This should occur on a routine basis (quarterly to Directors and CLT, and bi-annually to Council) on H&S training completion and incidents to allow effective oversight. Serious/critical incidents should be escalated more promptly as necessary. In the longer term, the Corporation should identify possible IT solutions for both incident reporting and training records. These should be considered in the context of the overall IT systems in place and the strategy for HR and IT. The training 	<p>Recommendations 1) & 2):</p> <p>In the short term, the Health and Safety Division will establish a common template for the Departments to report at the Branch level, for example, the number, type and location of incidents and training completion percentages for consolidation and reporting by Human Resource Services to Directors and CLT quarterly and to Council twice a year.</p> <p>Owner: Jacqueline Long – Executive Director, Human Resource Services</p> <p>Due date: Q3 2017</p> <p>Recommendation 3):</p> <p>In the longer term, Human Resource Services will partner with Information Technology Services to complete a requirements analysis</p>



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<p>record system should be linked to the employee record. For incident reporting, enhancements to PeopleSoft may be one option, but if the system is not able to be developed to meet the needs of the Corporation, other systems may need to be considered.</p>	<p>to fully understand the need for incident and training reporting across the corporation. This information will be utilized to inform recommendations regarding systems solutions and any support resources required. This will enable the identification of a solution, the ISSC process, and budget requests, as necessary.</p> <p>The timing of regular reporting on incidents and training to Directors/CLT/Council will be confirmed, modified and communicated, as appropriate, once the IT system/support solution is in place.</p> <p>Owner: Jacqueline Long – Executive Director, Human Resource Services</p> <p>Due date: Q4 2018</p>
2	<p>Medium</p>	<p>Current organizational support for H&S</p> <p>At present resources are split between Corporate H&S (in HR) and Fire Services. There is duplication of effort in support for H&S and processes are not consistent. In addition H&S protocols are developed in departments without consulting the Corporate H&S team.</p> <p>We recommend considering combining H&S resources in Corporate H&S and Fire Services to</p>	<p>The Human Resource Services branch will lead a requirements analysis with key stakeholders to determine how best to approach collaboration and integration across branches. A key outcome of this endeavour will be the identification of common Health and Safety training requirements across the Corporation and determine how best to utilize the resources available to deliver programs across the Corporation.</p>



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		allow more effective co-ordination of resources across the whole Corporation. This will also help to ensure a member of staff can be accountable for H&S across the whole Corporation. While acknowledging the uniqueness of training required in Fire Services, processes could be made consistent in some H&S training. This could also help to provide support to departments in developing required safety protocols.	Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety Due date: Q3 2017
3	Medium	<p>Training requirements of staff</p> <p>It is currently the responsibility of individual managers to identify the training requirements of staff in their area. There has been no overall assessment performed of the H&S training needs of staff within departments so staff may be trained on an inconsistent basis.</p> <p>In order to ensure consistency of the process an exercise should be undertaken by departments and branches to identify minimum H&S expectations of all roles in their area, with additional training added as required. HR should review this to ensure completeness and consistency where appropriate.</p>	<p>Human Resource Services will lead a review with key stakeholders to identify minimum H&S requirements for each position within each branch. This will include the development of a 'checklist' for each branch to use when onboarding an employee that is new to the Corporation.</p> <p>Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety Due date: Q3 2018</p> <p>Will require project resources currently not available. Requirements will be identified and, if necessary, reflected in the 2018 budget process.</p>
4	Medium	<p>Escalation process for non-completion of training</p> <p>Currently there is no routine follow up or escalation of staff who have not</p>	Human Resource Services will establish a policy and procedure, in consultation with CLT, for supervisors/managers/directors to identify and follow up regarding



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<p>completed training. The current systems in place do not allow for easy oversight of training completion so a system that allows for recording and reporting is required (as per Recommendation 1).</p> <p>We recommend that a follow up process needs to be developed and articulated by HR, with responsibility for training completion at the Director level. This should include identification of reminders to undertake training to the staff member, escalation to their manager if training does not occur within a defined time period and further escalation to the Director and Commissioner for continued non-compliance.</p>	<p>mandatory Health and Safety training completion, in the interim, pending completion of Recommendation One and subsequent follow up of implementation in 2019.</p> <p>Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety</p> <p>Due date: Q2 2017</p>
5	Low	<p>JHSC Requirements</p> <p>After assessment of the JHSCs, we noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • JHSC ToR is outdated (May 1, 2002) with reference to Occupational Health and Safety Co-Ordination Committee Structure which does not presently exist at the City of Oshawa. • We were unable to determine if 12/15 incident reports were reported to the JHSCs as there is no tracking system in place. Per discussion with the JHSCs, we were informed incident reports are usually provided in large batches 	



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<p>periodically. If incidents reports are being provided in an untimely manner this will result in reports being reviewed for informational purposes only opposed to allowing the JHSC to play an active role in shaping the H&S environment at the City.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● JHSC C (Fire Services), F (Adult Crossing Guard) and G (Municipal Law Enforcement Officers) do not have formalized inspection schedules. ● Through our testing of inspection reports, IA noted 3/6 inspections were not conducted in a timely manner as per schedule. <p>We recommend:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Updating the JHSC ToR to reflect legislative and City changes. 2. Implement a process in order to track when incident reports are provided to the JHSCs. 3. Formalize inspection schedules for JHSC C (Fire Services), F (Adult Crossing Guard) and G (Municipal Law Enforcement Officers) 4. Moving forward, the H&S department should consider collecting inspection schedules from all JHSCs annually to assess the appropriateness and completeness of the schedules. In addition, consider auditing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Engage union representatives and Co-Chairs of the JHSCs to renew the current terms of reference. Submit, as required, to the Ministry of Labour a revised JHSC Terms of Reference for approval. 2. JHSC do receive copies of all incident reports for their regular meetings, however, these are distributed in hard copy and returned to the Manager, Health and Safety for destruction. A procedure for identification of incident reports reviewed will



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<p>inspection reports to see if they are being performed and if performance is occurring in a timely manner.</p>	<p>be established with the JHSC on a go forward basis.</p> <p>3. A review of the current inspection scheduled will be undertaken and revision made as necessary. A formalized reporting protocol will be established with each JHSC.</p> <p>4. Corporate Health and Safety will establish a protocol to ensure all inspection schedules and reports are assessed on an annual basis to identify any gaps or opportunities for improvement.</p> <p>Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety</p> <p>Due date: 1. Q2, 2017; 2. Jan 2017; 3. Q1 2017; 4. Q4 2017</p>
6	Low	<p>Incident report review by Operational Safety and Training staff</p> <p>As part of the incident report review process, the Operational Safety and Training and Fire Training staff review the reports to assess if appropriate preventative actions have been identified and if any further training is required for future deterrence. Once this review process is complete, it is documented on incident report under the “Actions by Departmental Safety/Training Staff” section. Per IA sample testing it was noted, 9/15 incident reports did not have a</p>	<p>The importance of completing this section will be reinforced with all stakeholders. Reports will be audited periodically to test for completeness.</p> <p>Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety</p> <p>Due date: February 2017</p>



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<p>completed "Actions by Departmental Safety/Training Staff" section.</p> <p>We recommend the H&S team emphasize the importance of completing this section and audit incident reports periodically to obtain assurance reports are being assessed to determine the appropriateness of preventable actions and identification of further training, where deemed necessary.</p>	
7	Low	<p>Annual Review of Policies and Procedures – OSHA Part III Section 25.(2)(j)</p> <p>We were unable to determine if City of Oshawa's H&S policies and procedures are reviewed on a periodic basis as they do not include a last reviewed date at the Corporate level. From inspection of the policies and procedures (including those of Fire Services), we noted the majority of documents were dated 2013 and prior. Further analysis indicated there are discrepancies between what the OSHA defines as critical and serious injury and the written policies at the City. This discrepancy in language did not lead to us finding evidence of non-compliance with OSHA in terms of reporting incidents.</p> <p>We recommend:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Establishing a review protocol to illustrate the frequency at which 	<p>The Corporate Health and Safety Policy is reviewed annually followed by a confirmation memorandum to the Executive Director of Human Resources. This meets the legislative requirement.</p> <p>The discrepancy identified in the current document is an administrative error and has been corrected. The Policy is compliant with the OSHA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A Policy outlining a formal review process will be implemented for the Policy, Safe Work Standards and



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
		<p>H&S policies and procedures will be reviewed.</p> <p>2. Creating a log of all policies and procedures (including the JHSC ToR and department specific safety protocols) where the last review date can be tracked. In addition, the log should be periodically monitored to ensure it is in accordance with the review protocols developed.</p>	<p>Operational Guidelines in Fire Services.</p> <p>2. A formal process to track the review date of the Policy, Safe Work Standards and Operational Guidelines in Fire Services will be established.</p> <p>Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety</p> <p>Due date: April 2017</p>
8	Low	<p>Volunteers at the Corporation</p> <p>At present it is not known how many volunteers are active with the City. In addition volunteers currently support the OSCC, and they could, in legal terms, be deemed to be volunteers of the City as all OSCC staff are City staff.</p> <p>It is not known what H&S training is provided to the volunteers across the Corporation, where they exist. Due to recent changes in the legislation expanding the definition of a worker, oversight of volunteers has become a legislative requirement (including for H&S purposes).</p> <p>We recommend identification of volunteers across the Corporation and tracking these individuals to ensure H&S training is provided as necessary.</p>	<p>It is required that the Respect in the Workplace Policy be reviewed with all volunteers. However, the legislation does not expand the definition of a worker to volunteers for all things identified in the OHS Act.</p> <p>A legal opinion would be prudent to determine if the volunteers to OSCC fall under the purview of the City.</p> <p>The definition of a worker under the act is:</p> <p>“worker” means any of the following, but does not include an inmate of a correctional institution or like institution or facility who participates inside the institution or facility in a work project or rehabilitation program:</p> <p>1. A person who performs work or supplies services for monetary compensation.</p>



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
			<p>2. A secondary school student who performs work or supplies services for no monetary compensation under a work experience program authorized by the school board that operates the school in which the student is enrolled.</p> <p>3. A person who performs work or supplies services for no monetary compensation under a program approved by a college of applied arts and technology, university or other post-secondary institution.</p> <p>4. A person who receives training from an employer, but who, under the Employment Standards Act, 2000, is not an employee for the purposes of that Act because the conditions set out in subsection 1 (2) of that Act have been met.</p> <p>5. Such other persons as may be prescribed who perform work or supply services to an employer for no monetary compensation; (“travailleur”)</p> <p>‘As may be prescribed’ is relevant to this discussion as our understanding is that volunteers have not been ‘prescribed’ by law at this time. This was included in recommended revision to the Act however pulled out in the final moments.</p> <p>Health and Safety will work with the various branches throughout</p>



#	Risk	Recommendation	Management response, owner and deadline
			<p>the organization to identify and catalogue volunteer usage and the required training associated with each.</p> <p>Owner: Glenn Thurston – Manager, Health and Safety</p> <p>Due date: June 2017</p>



Appendices

Appendix A: Summary of work

In line with the objectives of the scope, we have assessed the processes and controls in place around H&S. The following Appendix demonstrates the relevant processes we have identified and the key controls in place to mitigate risks. We have commented on the design of these controls in the right-hand column. Where controls have been deemed to be designed effectively, we have gone on to test their operating effectiveness in Appendix B.

Overall Incident Reporting

As a part of fieldwork, we walked through the overall incident reporting process and is identified below.

Process	Control	KPMG comments on design
<p>A workplace incident or accident occurs and it is reported to the H&S Manager.</p>	<p>Incidents should be reported by the employee immediately to the supervisor or manager and to the H&S Manager within 24-72 hours (depending on the nature of the incident).</p>	<p>✓ 15/15 incidents reports were reported to the Corporate H&S Manager within a timely manner.</p>
	<p>Incidents and accidents are reported using a standardized Supervisor and Employee Incident/Accident Investigation Report form.</p>	<p>✓ The use of the standardized incident reporting form is being used consistently across the City.</p>
<p>Depending on the type of incident, the H&S Division within HR provides guidance to staff on next steps to follow.</p>	<p>Formally documented policies and procedures are available to staff indicating the next steps to follow when a specific type incident or accident occurs.</p>	<p>✓ Policies and procedures are readily accessible to staff on the City of Oshawa intranet.</p>



Process	Control	KPMG comments on design
<p>Once the incident report is received by the H&S Division within HR, the report is reviewed.</p>	<p>Upon receipt the incident report is entered into the HRIS (PeopleSoft) system.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A conscious decision was made to discontinue use of PeopleSoft program and move to a paper based system. IA noted incidents have not been recorded in PeopleSoft since 2014. <p>Recommendation 1</p>
	<p>The H&S team assess if a Workplace Safety and Insurance Board (WSIB) claim needs to be prepared and if so, WSIB form 7 is completed.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ An internal excel spreadsheet was developed to keep track of all WSIB claims along with critical information related to recovery and modified duties.
	<p>The Operational Safety and Training and Fire Training staff review the incident report to assess if appropriate preventative actions have been identified and if any further training is required for future deterrence.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 9/15 incident reports reviewed did not have a completed "Actions by Departmental Safety/Training Staff" section. Recommendation 6
<p>Assess whether or not the Ministry of Labour, Union Reps or WSIB needs to be informed about the incident.</p>	<p>Formally documented policies and procedures are available to staff indicating which parties should be informed when a specific type of incident occurs.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Policies and procedures are readily accessible to staff on the City of Oshawa intranet.



Process	Control	KPMG comments on design
<p>Notify the JHSC of the incident within an acceptable timeframe in accordance with the OHSA.</p>	<p>All JHSCs meet at minimum once every three months as required by OHSA and review incidents; however, JHSC is notified within four days of critical incidents.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are opportunities available to the City to better track if an incident report has been sent to the JHSC as IA was unable to determine if 12/15 incidents reports were submitted to JHSC for review. <p>Recommendation 5</p>



Appendix B: Summary of testing results

We summarize below the results of the compliance testing we have performed over the controls in place.

Incident Reporting



Findings

We obtained all incidents reported from January to October 2016. As the controls in place operates on a more than weekly basis but less than daily basis we selected a sample of 15 incidents to conduct detailed testing.

- ✓ 15/15 incidents are reported to the H&S Manager within a timely manner (24 to 72 hours, depending on the severity of the incident).
- 9/15 incident reports reviewed by IA did not have a completed "Actions by Departmental Safety/Training Staff" section. Per policy, each incident report will be reviewed by the Operational Safety and Training and Fire Training staff to assess the appropriateness of preventative actions identified and determine if further training is required for future deterrence. **Recommendation 6**
- IA was unable to determine if 12/15 incident reports were submitted to JHSC for review and if this occurred within a timely manner. **Recommendation 5**



JHSC



Findings

We obtained a listing of all inspection completed from January to October 2016. As the controls in place operates on a more than monthly basis but less than weekly basis we selected a sample of six inspections (one per committee) to conduct detailed testing.

- 3/6 inspections did not occur in a timely manner as per JHSC schedule.

Recommendation 5

- 3/6 JHSC do not have a formalized inspection schedule. **Recommendation 5**



Appendix C: Staff involvement and documents reviewed

We undertook interviews in October 2016 with key stakeholders to inform this work, including:

Name	Title
Glenn Thurston	Manager, Human Resources Services and Safety
Ella Marsh-Seaver	Attendance and Disability Advisor
George Herc	Equipment Safety and Training Coordinator
Jim Naumovski	Recreational and Culture Facilities Operation Manager
Jan McDonnell	Supervisor of Recreational Programs
Mike Saulnier	Manager, Operations for Waste and Fleet.
Phil Lyon	Manager, Community Service Department and Road Operations
Lisa Cullick	Clerk D (JHSC A committee member)
Charlie Drake	Manager, Operations and Maintenance (JHSC B committee member)
Scott Wood	Chief Training Officer of Fire Services (JHSC C committee member)
Robin McDonnell	Registration Software Program Coordinator (JHSC D committee member)
Terry Drinkle	Rover Crossing Guard (JHSC F committee member)
Nichole Howard	Municipal Law Enforcement and Licensing Officer (JHSC G committee member)
Linda Mielewczyk	Manager, Applications Support

We received the following documentation over the course of fieldwork:

- H&S policies and procedures for Corporate H&S and Fire Services
- Training records for Corporate H&S and Fire Services
- 2015 Safety Training Catalogue
- List of mandatory training courses and frequency
- Three year training plan along with the 2016 Training Calendar for Fire Services
- Training Topic List for Fire Services

825



- Operating training and testing forms
- Safety training request form
- Job description for high risk positions
- Reported incidents that occurred in 2014, 2015 and 2016
- JHSC ToR and inspection schedules along with checklists used during inspection