1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Council’s position on Heritage Oshawa’s recommendation to designate the former McLaughlin House, located at 195 Simcoe Street North, as a property of cultural heritage value or interest under the Ontario Heritage Act.

On December 14, 2017, Heritage Oshawa recommended that the former McLaughlin House be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.

On February 5, 2018, Development Services Committee adopted the following resolution:

“That Item DS-18-07 being the First Report of Heritage Oshawa recommending the designation of 195 Simcoe Street North as a property of cultural heritage significance under the Ontario Heritage Act be referred to staff for a report; and,

That staff send the Heritage Oshawa resolution and Heritage Research Report related to 195 Simcoe Street North and information on the City’s Heritage Property Tax Reduction program to the owner of the property and request input from the owner on Heritage Oshawa’s recommendation to designate the property; and,

That the report from staff include input that may be received from the property owner.”

Attachment 1 shows the location of the former McLaughlin House as well the existing zoning in the area.

Attachment 2 is a copy of the letter dated April 3, 2017 from Nantuck Investments Inc., owner of the properties at 195 and 201 Simcoe Street North and 12 and 16 Elgin Street East indicating their desire to demolish the buildings on the properties.
Attachment 3 is a copy of the Heritage Research Report for the former McLaughlin House dated November 2017 and prepared by local heritage consultant Melissa Cole.

Attachment 4 is a copy of a letter dated February 21, 2018 from the City staff to Nantuck Investments Inc. as directed by the Development Services Committee.

Attachment 5 is a copy of a letter dated March 23, 2018 from the law office of Shirtliff-Hinds, solicitor on behalf of Nantuck Investments Inc. in response to the City’s February 21, 2018 letter (Attachment 4).

2.0 Recommendation

That the Development Services Committee select an appropriate option as set out in Section 5.9 of Report DS-18-86 dated May 3, 2018.

3.0 Executive Summary

Not applicable.

4.0 Input From Other Sources

The following have provided input for the preparation of this report:

- Heritage Oshawa
- Nantuck Investments Inc., owner of the property at 195 Simcoe Street North

5.0 Analysis

5.1 Heritage Oshawa Inventory of City of Oshawa Heritage Properties

The Heritage Oshawa Inventory of City of Oshawa Heritage Properties (the Inventory) identifies properties of cultural heritage value or interest within the City of Oshawa. The Inventory includes all properties on the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as well as properties identified as ‘Class A’ or ‘Class B’.

Class A properties are properties that have been evaluated by Heritage Oshawa and are determined to have the highest potential for designation.

Class B properties are properties that have been evaluated by Heritage Oshawa and are determined to have good potential for designation.

The subject site is currently identified as a Class A property on Heritage Oshawa’s Inventory of City of Oshawa Heritage Properties.
5.2 The City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (the ‘Register’) is the list of properties from the Inventory that have been formally recognized by Council, pursuant to Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act, as being properties within the City of Oshawa having cultural heritage value or interest.

The Register includes designated and non-designated properties.

All designated properties within the City of Oshawa are automatically listed on the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

The subject site is not listed on the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

5.3 Background

On April 3, 2017, Nantuck Investments Inc. indicated in a letter to the City, their intent to demolish the buildings on the properties located at 195 and 201 Simcoe Street North and 12 and 16 Elgin Street East.

On April 27, 2017 Heritage Oshawa considered the owner’s proposal to demolish the house and passed the following resolution (HTG-17-31):

“Whereas 195 Simcoe Street North and 201 Simcoe Street North were built in 1889 and 1890 and are Class A and B properties in the Inventory of Heritage Properties, respectively; and,

Whereas these properties are situated in a continuous heritage landscape of high heritage and cultural value as outlined by the Ontario Heritage Act criteria, especially 195 Simcoe Street North's cultural value and interest as the former home of Robert and Eleanor McLaughlin, a family which has had a tremendous economic impact on the growth of Oshawa's community; and,

Whereas both exhibit attractive designs that complement each other and other heritage properties in the area, and that represent the grandeur of homes in this area of Oshawa at the turn of the twentieth century; and,

Whereas they both complement and form part of the story of Parkwood Estate, a national historic site; and,

Whereas they form part of the transition from the downtown commercial center to the residential area of Oshawa; and,

Whereas they are near other heritage properties and their demolition would negatively affect the heritage landscape of the area; and,

Whereas the future intention of the property is unclear; and,
Whereas Heritage Oshawa is an Advisory Committee to Council for heritage issues; and,

Therefore, be it resolved:

1. That Heritage Oshawa is not in favour of the demolition of 195 and 201 Simcoe Street North; and,
2. That these properties be considered for adaptive reuse rather than demolition; and,
3. That Heritage Oshawa to engage a consultant to undertake a heritage research report for the properties at 195 Simcoe Street North and 201 Simcoe Street North to more fully determine the heritage value of these structures.”

At a subsequent meeting on May 25, 2017, Heritage Oshawa amended the above-noted resolution to remove 201 Simcoe Street North from the research report.

As of May 3, 2018 the owner has not formally submitted a permit application for demolition for the building at 195 Simcoe Street North.

5.4 Heritage Research Report

In accordance with Item 3 of Heritage Oshawa’s April 27, 2017 resolution, Heritage Oshawa engaged Melissa Cole, a qualified heritage consultant, to prepare a heritage research report for the McLaughlin House, located at 195 Simcoe Street North. Ms. Cole’s heritage research report dated November 2017 forms Attachment 3 to this report.

The 2017 heritage research report for the McLaughlin House provides evidence that the property meets several of the criteria for designation under the Ontario Heritage Act under the following three categories:

1. Design or physical value
2. Historical/associative value
3. Contextual value

On December 14, 2017 Heritage Oshawa recommended that the McLaughlin House be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act and passed the following motion (HTG-17-86):

“That Heritage Oshawa recommends to the Development Services Committee:

Whereas Heritage Oshawa has received a research report on 195 Simcoe Street North, home of Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company and father of Colonel R. S. McLaughlin, founder of General Motors Canada; and,

Whereas the report demonstrates that 195 Simcoe Street North meets the criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 for designation; and,

Whereas this property has design and physical value because the building contains examples of Colonial Revival design in the central front entranceway with transom, returned eaves, the front façade containing a 3-bay design (center door, flanking windows); and,
Whereas the property has associative value as it was the home of Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company, and his third wife Eleanor McLaughlin, a family that had tremendous economic impact on the growth of Oshawa; and,

Whereas this property has contextual value because 195 Simcoe Street North is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the area in which it stands because it is one of the early homes constructed on Simcoe Street North which is reflective of Oshawa’s early settlers and the beginnings of development in this part of the City; and,

Whereas this property was the home of Oshawa Mayor R. H. James in 1909;

Therefore be it resolved that 195 Simcoe Street North be designated as a property of cultural heritage significance under the Ontario Heritage Act.”

On February 5, 2018, Development Services Committee adopted the following resolution:

“That Item DS-18-07 being the First Report of Heritage Oshawa recommending the designation of 195 Simcoe Street North as a property of cultural heritage significance under the Ontario Heritage Act be referred to staff for a report; and,

That staff send the Heritage Oshawa resolution and Heritage Research Report related to 195 Simcoe Street North and information on the City’s Heritage Property Tax Reduction program to the owner of the property and request input from the owner on Heritage Oshawa’s recommendation to designate the property; and,

That the report from staff include input that may be received from the property owner.”

This report responds to the Development Services Committee’s February 5, 2018 direction.

5.5 Historical Significance of the McLaughlin House

The heritage research report dated November 2017 (see Attachment 3) generally summarizes the McLaughlin House’s cultural heritage value or interest as follows:

- This property has design and physical value because the building contains examples of Classical Revival design in the central front entranceway with transom, returned eaves, the front façade containing a 3-bay design (centre door, flanking windows).

- This property has associative value as it was the home of Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company and his third wife Eleanor McLaughlin, a family that had tremendous economic impact on the growth of Oshawa.

- This property has contextual value because 195 Simcoe Street North is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the area in which it stands because it is one of the early homes constructed on Simcoe Street North which is reflective of Oshawa’s early settlers and the beginnings of development in this part of the city.
This property has contextual value as it is historically linked to its surroundings because it forms part of the Parkwood Estate story due to its location and previous owner, Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company and father of Colonel R.S. McLaughlin.

Heritage Oshawa recommends that the McLaughlin House be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act for its design and physical, associative and contextual values.

5.6 The Provincial Policy Statement

The Provincial Policy Statement (P.P.S.) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. Section 3 of the Planning Act requires that decisions affecting planning matters “shall be consistent with” policy statements issued under the Act.

Section 2.6 of the P.P.S. addresses Cultural Heritage and Archaeology and in particular states that (among other things):

“Planning authorities shall not permit development and site alteration on adjacent lands to protected heritage property except where the proposed development and site alteration has been evaluated and it has been demonstrated that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property will be conserved.”

This Section of the P.P.S. currently does not apply to the McLaughlin House since it is not a designated property.

5.7 Register Designated Versus Register Non-designated

5.7.1 Non-designated Properties Listed on the Register

The McLaughlin House is currently identified on the Heritage Oshawa Inventory of City of Oshawa Heritage Properties as a Class A property. A Class A property has no standing, or special protection, under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Council may choose to promote a property to the status of a non-designated property on the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (City Register). This can be done through a resolution of Council, subject to consultation with Heritage Oshawa.

There is no legislated appeal process for the addition by Council of a non-designated property to the City’s Register.

A Register Non-designated property is protected under the Ontario Heritage Act. This protection equates to the requirement of the owner of the property to not demolish or remove a building or structure on the property without the owner giving the Council of the municipality at least 60 days notice in writing of the owner’s intention to demolish or remove the building or structure.
There are no legislated obligations regarding proposed alterations to a Register Non-designated property. However, the City’s standard practice is for Heritage Oshawa to review and comment on alteration proposals for Register Non-designated properties.

5.7.2 Designated Properties Listed on the Register

A Register Designated property is offered protection under the Ontario Heritage Act from alteration and demolition. The owner of a Register Designated property must apply to Council for approval of any alteration (as it may impact heritage attributes established in the designation by-law) or demolition and receive consent in writing from Council. Council must first consult with its municipal heritage committee (Heritage Oshawa) prior to deciding on the proposed alteration or demolition. The Ontario Heritage Act further details the process for request of approval of alteration or demolition and the associated appeal process.

5.7.3 Effect on Process to Alter or Demolish

Only the owner can object to Council’s decision regarding an application to alter or demolish a designated structure. In the case of an application for alteration, the owner has 30 days from the issuance of the Notice of Decision to Refuse, to object to Council’s decision. This objection is then referred to the Conservation Review Board (C.R.B.). The C.R.B. holds a hearing and reports to Council on the matter. Council considers the C.R.B. report and makes a final decision on the request for alteration. If Council refuses to consent to the application for alteration, then the property cannot be altered.

In the case of a designated property, if the owner applies to Council for the demolition of a designated structure, the owner has 30 days to appeal Council’s decision to the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (L.P.A.T.). The L.P.A.T. deals with the matter and makes a final decision.

In the case of the demolition of a non-designated property listed on the Register, the owner is required to give Council at least 60 days notice in writing of the owner’s intention to demolish the building. There is no decision/appeal/objection process associated with this requirement.

5.8 Heritage Designation Process

The Ontario Heritage Act provides a framework for identification, conservation and protection of cultural heritage resources.

The Ontario Heritage Act empowers a municipality to designate, by by-law, a property to be of cultural heritage value or interest.

A heritage designation under the Ontario Heritage Act:

- Recognizes the importance of a property to the local community;
- Protects the property's cultural heritage value;
- Encourages good stewardship and conservation; and
- Promotes knowledge and understanding about the property.
The designation of the McLaughlin House would be governed by Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for individual property designation.

The Ontario Heritage Act requires that a municipal council must consult with its municipal heritage committee, where one exists, before considering a designation.

The Ontario Heritage Act specifies that a Notice of Intention to Designate a property be served on the owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust as well as being published in a newspaper having general circulation in the municipality. Based on City policy any Notice of Intention to Designate would be published in both the Oshawa This Week and Oshawa Express newspapers.

A Notice of Intention to Designate a property must include:

1. The Description of Property so that it can be readily identified;

2. The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, which identifies the property’s heritage significance;

3. The Description of Heritage Attributes outlining the particular features that should be protected for the future; and

4. A statement that any notice of objection to the designation must be filed with the municipality within 30 days after the date of publication of the newspaper notice.

If no objections are filed with the municipality within 30 days after the date of publication of notice in the newspaper, the council can proceed to pass a by-law designating the property.

If an objection to a designation is filed with the municipality within the 30 day period, Council must refer the objection to the Conservation Review Board (Review Board) for a hearing. The Review Board will then hold a hearing and make recommendations to Council. Council is not bound to follow the recommendations of the Review Board but must consider the Review Board’s report. Council then decides whether to pass a designating by-law or withdraw its intention to designate.

5.9 Options

The McLaughlin House located at 195 Simcoe Street North is currently identified as a Class A property on Heritage Oshawa’s Inventory of City of Oshawa Heritage Properties.

The 2017 McLaughlin House heritage research report (Attachment 3) establishes the reasons for designation pursuant to the Ontario Heritage Act. On December 14, 2017 Heritage Oshawa recommended that the McLaughlin House be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Three key options are available to the Development Services Committee to deal with the subject matter.
5.9.1 Option 1: Status Quo

Should the Development Services Committee wish to maintain the status quo and have the McLaughlin House located at 195 Simcoe Street North remain as a “Class A” property on the Inventory, then the following recommendation should be adopted:

“That the Development Services Committee recommends to City Council:

That, pursuant to Report DS-18-86 dated May 3, 2018, the McLaughlin House located at 195 Simcoe Street North not be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act and that it remain as a Class A property on the Heritage Oshawa Inventory of City of Oshawa Heritage Properties.”

5.9.2 Option 2: List as Register, Non-designated

Should the Development Services Committee propose to have the McLaughlin House located at 195 Simcoe Street North formally recognized by Council pursuant to Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act, as being a property within the City of Oshawa having cultural heritage value or interest, in which case it would become a “listed, non-designated” property on the Register, then the following recommendation should be adopted:

“That the Development Services Committee recommends to City Council:

That, pursuant to Report DS-18-86 dated May 3, 2018, the McLaughlin House, located at 195 Simcoe Street North, be included on the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as a non-designated property.

By email dated April 19, 2018 the owner advised that they are not in favour of listing the property as a non-designated property on the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

5.9.3 Option 3: Designate

Should the Development Services Committee propose that the McLaughlin House located at 195 Simcoe Street North be designated as a property of cultural heritage value or interest pursuant to Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, in which case it would become a “listed, designated” property on the Register, then the following recommendation should be adopted:

“That the Development Services Committee recommends to City Council:

1. That, pursuant to Report DS-18-86 dated May 3, 2018, Development Services staff be authorized to undertake the process established in the Ontario Heritage Act to designate, the McLaughlin House, located at 195 Simcoe Street North, as a property of cultural heritage value or interest under the Ontario Heritage Act by undertaking the following:

(a) Prepare a Notice of Intention to Designate the property known as the McLaughlin House, located at 195 Simcoe Street North under the Ontario Heritage Act;
(b) Publish the Notice in the Oshawa This Week and Oshawa Express newspapers;

(c) Forward the Notice to the Ontario Heritage Trust in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act; and

(d) Prepare the necessary by-law and Designation Statement and Description, with input from Heritage Oshawa, for approval by Council.”

In a letter dated March 23, 2018 (Attachment 5), the solicitor representing Sherland and Shanta Chhangur (Nantuck Investments Inc.) has expressed that they are not in favour of having the property designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The general reasons for the property owners position are as follows:

- The original building is completely different from the building that exists presently given the change of use of the property from residential to office in the 1960’s.
- Additional renovations have occurred which also changed the building.
- The property requires future improvements and such improvements cannot be readily made once a Heritage Act designation is in place. Any attempted rehabilitation of the property with a heritage designation in place will be cost prohibitive.
- There are a number of institutions that already recognize Mr. Robert McLaughlin and his family (i.e. Art Gallery and Library).

6.0 Financial Implications

There are no costs associated with Options 1 or 2.

The costs associated with Option 3 are related to notice requirements, which can be accommodated within the Department’s budget.

In the event of any objection to the Notice of Intention to Designate and referral to the Conservation Review Board, the appropriate City staff and the Heritage consultant would need to participate in the hearing. These costs can be accommodated within the Departmental budget.
7.0 Relationship to the Oshawa Strategic Plan

The information in this report addresses the Cultural Vitality goal of the Oshawa Strategic Plan.

Warren Munro, HBA, Director,
Planning Services

Paul D. Ralph, BES, RPP, MCIP, Commissioner,
Development Services Department
Subject: Heritage Oshawa's Recommendation to Designate the Former McLaughlin House Under the Ontario Heritage Act
Address: 195 Simcoe Street North
File: B-8600-0319

Item: DS-18-86
Attachment 1
Development Services Department

SEE BY-LAW 16-94

OSP/CIN

R6-B/OC-A

MIN(1)
Nantuck Investments Inc
103 Radley Street, Woodbridge, Ontario L4L 8K4
Telephone: 905-856-3442 Fax: 905-856-4901

DELIVERED BY FAX: 905-436-5699
VIA EMAIL: skish@oshawa.ca

April 3, 2017

Margaret Kish,
Senior Planner, Planning Services
City of Oshawa
50 Center Street South
Oshawa, Ontario
L1H 3Z7

Dear Ms. Kish:

Re: 195 & 201 Simcoe Street North, 12 & 16 Elgin Street East, Oshawa

Please be advised that it is my intention to demolish the above noted properties in the City of Oshawa and as per the advice from your office I am formally making a request to verify that there is no objection from the Heritage Committee for me to proceed with a permit to demolish.

Thanking you in anticipation.

Yours truly,

NANTUCK INVESTMENTS INC.

Per: Sherland Chhangur
Research Report

McLaughlin House
195 Simcoe Street North
Oshawa, ON

Prepared for Heritage Oshawa
Melissa Cole, Local Heritage Consultant
November 2017
# Table of Contents

**Introduction**  
i. Purpose of Report  2  
ii. Legislative Context  2  

**Description of Property**  
i. Location  3  
ii. Legal Description  3  
iii. Site Description  3  

**Historical Context**  
i. Summary  4  
ii. Early Lot History  4  
iii. Owners  4  

**Structural Design and Architecture**  
i. Date of Construction  7  
ii. Form and Design  7  
iii. Foundation  7  
iv. Roof  7  
v. Entrances  7  
vi. Window Openings  8  

**Applicability of Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act**  9  

**Resources**  10  

**Current Photographs of the Property**  11  

**Historical Photographs/Illustrations**  14
Introduction

i. Purpose of Report

This report evaluates the cultural heritage significance of 195 Simcoe Street North in the City of Oshawa in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06, Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

The purpose of this undertaking is to more fully determine the heritage value of the property in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act (the Act)

ii. Legislative Context

Ontario Regulation 9/06 under the Ontario Heritage Act sets out the criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, which is required in order to designate a property under the provisions of Part IV of the Act.

A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets one or more of the following criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:
   i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
   ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
   iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,
   i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
   ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
   iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.

3. The property has contextual value because it,
   i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,
   ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
   iii. is a landmark.

After analyzing the history of and heritage attributed to the subject property, it is concluded that the subject property merits designation under the Ontario Heritage Act in light of criteria 1 (i) 2 (i) and 3 (i, ii).
Description of Property

i. Location

The house at 195 Simcoe Street North is located south of Adelaide Avenue East and north of Elgin Street East.

ii. Legal Description

The property at 195 Simcoe Street North is located on the northwest part of lot 10 in the 2nd concession East Whitby Township, now the City of Oshawa. It is part of the plan known as the Karr Plan on the east side of Simcoe Street North.

iii. Site Description

Built circa 1887, the dwelling at 195 Simcoe Street North sits on a medium size lot. Located in a residential neighbourhood of early 20th century buildings, this home stands on the northeast corner of Simcoe Street North and Elgin Street East in the City of Oshawa. It was 1 of 4 homes in Oshawa that Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company, resided in. Currently the building stands vacant.

Location of 195 Simcoe Street North, Google Map August 2017
Historical Context

i. Summary

The house at 195 Simcoe Street North is designed in the Classical Revival Style (Neo-classical). This home is a fine example of early brick construction in Oshawa. Constructed circa 1887, prior to the construction boom in the 1920s when the McLaughlin automobile factory and other industries were profitable. It is known as the “McLaughlin Home”. It was home to Robert McLaughlin and his wife Eleanor and domestic servant Elizabeth Welles from approximately 1901 - 1919. Mr. R. McLaughlin had moved his flourishing carriage works business to Oshawa in 1879. Enniskillen, the town where the business was originally located, lacked the efficient shipping facilities and Oshawa had a railway.

After spending decades as a family home, it was converted into office space in the 1960s. The building currently sits vacant on a medium size lot with little landscaping. The property is located a short distance away from Parkwood Estate National Historic site, which was the home of Robert McLaughlin’s son, Robert Samuel McLaughlin. The lot is part of an area of Simcoe Street North that contains businesses and is adjacent to an established residential area. The home stands in a neighbourhood that forms part of the transition from the downtown commercial centre to the residential area of Oshawa.

ii. Early Lot History

Isabella Shaw received the patent for lot 10, concession 2 on May 16th, 1798. It was sold to Francis Leys in 1819 who in turn sold it to Norris Karr in 1832. It was during the ownership of the land by the Karr (Kerr) family that, beginning in 1834, the earliest subdivision into ¼ and ½ acre lots took place. Early directories indicate that, in 1837, occupants of this lot included both the actual owners and tenants. These individuals included Thomas Chatterson, William Karr (Kerr), James Ross and Sullivan Turner. (Walton 1837)

The 1877 Beers Map of the Village of Oshawa indicates that the southwest section of Concession 2, Lot 10 was subdivided by this time but there was no house on the property.

The home was purchased by Robert McLaughlin and his wife in 1901 and they sold the property in 1919 to a member the James Family. The home remained in the James family until the 1950s.

iii. Owners

Robert McLaughlin (1836-1921)

Robert McLaughlin was founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company and father of Colonel Robert Samuel McLaughlin (General Motors of Canada). He was married to Mary Smith in 1864 with whom he had two daughters and three sons named Robert Samuel, George and John. He started the carriage business in Enniskillen. In 1877, after his wife, Mary, mother of his five children, passed away, Robert moved the company to Oshawa for the excellent available shipping facilities. His family occupied a home on the corner of Athol and Alberts Street. When in 1899 the carriage company was destroyed by fire, Robert relocated the company to Gananoque but returned to Oshawa within the following year. His second wife Sarah Jane died this same year.
In 1901 he was widowed and living with his 34 year old daughter Mary Jane on Colbourne Street in Oshawa with a domestic servant, Besse McKweon. In 1901 he married Eleanor McCulloch, who became his third wife.

According to the 1911 Oshawa Census, Robert McLaughlin was living with his third wife Eleanor and servant Elizabeth Welles at 195 Simcoe Street North, Oshawa, Ontario. Dorothy McLaughlin Henderson describes this home that her grandfather Robert lived in:

“They resided in a yellow brick house. The house originally had a back kitchen and driving shed. It had an old fashioned garden – English style.”

When Robert McLaughlin died in 1921, from colon cancer, he was residing at 337 Simcoe Street North, located across the road from Parkwood Estate. Today there is a condo there called “Robert McLaughlin Heights”. He resided at 195 Simcoe Street North for approximately 19 years.

In addition to his role in the McLaughlin Carriage Company, he was a member of the town’s first board of health (1884) and its first board of water commissioners (1904), a school trustee and municipal councillor, mayor in 1899, a supporter of the Salvation Army, first president of the local Young Men’s Christian Association, a Freemason and a Templar, and an elder in St Andrew’s Presbyterian Church.

List of Owners/Tenants 1921 – 1990s according to Vernon’s City Directories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Owner /Tenant *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>R H James (Mayor of Oshawa 1909)</td>
<td>Owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924 – 1952</td>
<td>Lorne C James</td>
<td>Owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>Fredk. R., James</td>
<td>Owner Tenant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>Dr. J.P.G Maroois Fdrk. R., James</td>
<td>Tenant Owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>Pilot Insurance Co. Dr. H.H. Vollmer Dr. J. Maroois Dr. W. Langmaid</td>
<td>Tenants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>Pilot Insurance Co. Dr. H.H. Vollmer Dr. J. Maroois Dr. G.A. Kindree</td>
<td>Tenants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Dr. Larry Hurren Dr. John P. Maroois Dr. John P. Parry Parnor Pharmaceutical Management Ltd.</td>
<td>Tenants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Dr. Larry Hurren, Dentist Dr. John P. Maroois Dr. John P. Parry Parnor Pharmaceutical Management Ltd.</td>
<td>Tenants</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Current Owner

The current owner is Sherland Changer. On April 27, 2017 Mr. Changer made a presentation to Heritage Oshawa regarding the property at 195 Simcoe Street North. He was requesting comment of the demolition application for 195 and 201 Simcoe Street North. It currently stands vacant.
Structural Design and Architecture

i. Date of Construction

This home was built circa 1887.

ii. Form and Design

The house is a fine example of early brick construction in Oshawa. Typical of the Classical Revival style, the structure has a symmetrical 3-bay Georgian plan but with more refined, delicate features. The yellow brick has been covered in white paint. Quoins were present, on the corners of the home according to an image of the home from the collection of the Oshawa Archives. They have since been painted over.

This home is Classical Revival in style featuring, full two storey, 3-bay front façade (centre door, flanking windows), a T-shaped plan, hipped roof, quoining on the corners (currently covered in white paint), with three chimneys, one is located on the south side and two are located the east side of the building. The wide soffits are panelled and connected to the frieze by a decorative dental cornice.

A corner property, the house is oriented to the west onto Simcoe Street North. Elgin Street West is located to the south of the property. The builder or architect is not known.

The arrangement of all the features creates a formal, solid and sturdy building that was once a family home but has been converted to office use.

iii. Foundation

The foundation appears to be cement.

iv. Roof

Typical of the Classical Revival style, the hipped roof features a large overhang that is ornamented with dentil blocks along the cornice. The roof cladding is asphalt shingles. The one-storey side “sunroom” features a copper roof. There are two brick chimney stacks rising from the roof at the rear (east side) and another brick chimney rising from the roof on the south façade.

v. Entrances

The main door case features a portico that contains a single leaf (replacement) door with transom. The portico has a set of columns at the front, set on a stepped square plinth with simple square capitals at the top. The home once featured a Regency Style verandah but many don’t survive because they were made from wood which is less durable than products such as stone. A south entry is located within the same area of where an original south entry was located. Some renovations have occurred on the south façade where the sunroom is located today. There is a third door opening on the rear (east façade) that may be a renovation.
vi. **Window Openings**

The fenestration (window placement) is balanced on the prominent (west) façade but irregular on the remaining sides. The windows on the prominent west façade feature three large multi panes over single panel double hung sash windows topped by brick lintels and set on cement lug sills. Multi-paned sashes are seen on other period examples but most of these sashes are believed to be replacements. Some are double hung, others are fixed. Most of the upper sashes still contain 6 panes and the lower sashes would most likely have contained 9 panes based on the longer length of the lower sashes. Today they are single panes.

The south and west façades feature window openings that have been covered over by brick. The brick lintels are still evidenced through the white paint.
Applicability of Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*

In light of the findings of this report, it is concluded that the house located at 195 Simcoe Street North meets the criteria outlined in Regulation 9/06. The property meets the criteria for designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of 1. design or physical value, 2. historical/associative value and 3. contextual value.

- **1 (i)** This property has design and physical value because the building contains examples of Classical Revival design in the central front entranceway with transom, returned eaves, the front façade containing a 3-bay design (centre door, flanking windows).
- **2 (i)** This property has associative value as it was the home of Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company and his third wife Eleanor McLaughlin, a family that had tremendous economic impact on the growth of Oshawa.
- **3 (i)** This property has contextual value because 195 Simcoe Street North is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the area in which it stands because it is one of the early homes constructed on Simcoe Street North which is reflective of Oshawa’s early settlers and the beginnings of development in this part of the city.
- **3 (ii)** This property is historically linked to its surroundings because it forms part of the Parkwood Estate story due to its location and previous owner, Robert McLaughlin, founder of the McLaughlin Carriage Company and father of Colonel R.S. McLaughlin.
Resources


Bergey, Milton. *A Great Canadian Industry and Its Founder, 1921*

Durham Land Registry Office, Whitby ON.

East Whitby Township census, 1901, 1911, [www.collectionscanada.ca](http://www.collectionscanada.ca)

Genealogy File, Oshawa Archives

Henderson, Dorothy McLaughlin. *Robert McLaughlin - Carriage Builder.* Toronto 1972

Heritage Oshawa Minutes

*Vernon’s City of Oshawa Directory, 1921 -1995*

Walton Directory,

[www.ontarioarchitecture.com](http://www.ontarioarchitecture.com)
Current Photographs of the Property

West Façade facing west onto Simcoe Street North

Location of the home on the northeast corner of Simcoe Street North and Elgin Street
West and North façade

West Façade
South and East Façades

East Façade, Rear of the Building
Historical Photographs/Illustrations

Robert McLaughlin House, Oshawa Archives Collection
West and South Façades
February 21, 2018

Sherland Chhangur
Nantuck Investments Inc.
103 Radley Street
Woodbridge, ON L4L 8K4

Re: Heritage Oshawa's Recommendation to Designate 195 Simcoe Street North Under the Ontario Heritage Act
195 Simcoe Street North
Nantuck Investments Inc.

Please be advised that Development Services Committee at a meeting held on February 5, 2018 dealt with the above-noted matter and adopted the following recommendation:

"That Item DS-18-07 being the First Report of Heritage Oshawa recommending the designation of 195 Simcoe Street North as a property of cultural heritage significance under the Ontario Heritage Act be referred to staff for a report; and,

That staff send the Heritage Oshawa resolution and Heritage Research Report related to 195 Simcoe Street North and information on the City's Heritage Property Tax Reduction program to the owner of the property and request input from the owner on Heritage Oshawa's recommendation to designate the property; and,

That the report from staff include input that may be received from the property owner."

In accordance with the recommendation of Development Services Committee, attached are the following:

1. A copy of the heritage research report for the property located at 195 Simcoe Street North prepared by Melissa Cole, Local Heritage Consultant, and dated November 2017;

I am requesting that you provide me with your input on Heritage Oshawa's recommendation to designate the property, no later than March 20, 2018.

If you require further information or clarification, please contact Margaret Kish at the address shown or by telephone at (905) 436-3311, extension 2945 or by email to mkish@oshawa.ca.

Margaret Kish, MCIP, RPP, Senior Planner
Development Services Department

MK/c
Attachments
March 23, 2018

VIA FACSIMILE (905) 436-5699

City of Oshawa – Corporation
50 Centre Street South,
Oshawa, Ontario
L1H 3Z7

Attention: Margaret Kish

Dear Ms. Kish

Re: Development Services Committee request for owner input regarding 195 Simcoe Street North.

I have been recently retained by Mr. Sherland Chhangur and Ms. Shanta Chhangur in this matter. I thank you for the extension of time given to my clients to respond to your letter of February 21, 2018.

I confirm that the City of Oshawa has not published a Notice of Intention to Designate 195 Simcoe Street North ("proposed property") as a heritage property in any newspaper.

I further understand that this matter is presently at the informational gathering stage. Namely, staff from the City of Oshawa have been tasked with seeking the input from the property owner with respect to any proposed intention by the Development Services Committee to designate 195 Simcoe Street North as a property of cultural heritage significance pursuant to the Heritage Act.

Please be advised that the owner of the property is not in favour of the any Heritage Act Designation for a number of reasons:

1. The McLaughlin family lived at 195 Simcoe Street North for approximately 18 years from 1901 to 1919 and then the family home was converted into office
space in the 1960s. As such the original building is completely different from the building that exists presently;

2. Additional renovations occurred at 195 Simcoe Street North which also changed the original building. Examples include:
   a. Renovations on the south façade where the sunroom is presently located;
   b. Quoins that were present on the corners of the home have since been painted over;
   c. The Regency style verandah originally located on the house is no longer there; and
   d. the south and west façade feature window openings have been bricked over.

3. The proposed property was purchased in 2005. At the time of purchase the zoning was PSC-B, the same as the other properties to its north. To consider designating this property as a heritage property will not enhance the property. Furthermore, the property requires future improvements and such improvements cannot be readily made once a Heritage Act designation is in place. Any attempted rehabilitation of the proposed property with a heritage designation in place will be cost prohibitive.

4. Finally, there are a number of institutions that already recognize the contribution made by Mr. Robert McLaughlin and his family. For instance there is:
   a. a Robert McLaughlin Gallery located at 72 Queen Street, Civic Centre in Oshawa that honours the memory of Robert McLaughlin;
   b. a short distance away from the proposed property is Parkwood Estate National Historic site which was the home of Robert McLaughlin's son, Robert Samuel McLaughlin;
   c. Finally, there is the Robert McLaughlin main branch of the Public Library in Oshawa

Kindly accept this letter as the owners' response to the Development Services Committee's recommendation of February 5, 2018.

If I can be of further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours truly,

[Signature]

Carol Shirliff-Hinds
Barrister and Solicitor